Dimensions of execution quality: Recent evidence for US equity markets

Ekkehart Boehmer*

Mays Business School, Texas A&M University, College Station, Tx, 77845, USA

Received 30 June 2003; received in revised form 4 October 2004; accepted 2 November 2004

Abstract

I analyze market-order execution quality using order-based data reported in accordance with Securities and Exchange Commission Rule 11Ac1-5. These data facilitate a comprehensive investigation of multiple dimensions of execution quality, including measures of costs and speed, for large samples of common stocks on Nasdaq and the NYSE. The evidence is consistent with competitive equity markets. Overall execution costs on Nasdaq exceed those on the NYSE, but orders execute faster. This relationship reverses for larger orders exceeding 1,999 shares. The apparent trade-off between costs and speed suggests that

* I thank James Angel, Kerry Back, Shmuel Baruch, Robert Battalio, Paul Bennett, Hendrik Bessembinder, Beatrice Boehmer, Minder Cheng, Kee Chung, Shane Corwin, Rohit D'Souza, Amy Edwards, Joachim Grammig, Mark Gurliauci, Shane Johnson, Charles Jones, Pamela Moulton, Gideon Saar, Julie Wu, Lei Yu, an anonymous referee, and seminar participants at the New York Stock Exchange, Universita Bocconi, University of Notre Dame, University of Texas at San Antonio, the 2003 Financial Management Association meeting, the 2003 Duke/NYSE conference, and the 2004 European Finance Association conference for very valuable comments and discussions. Christopher Gieckel and Melissa Chak were very helpful in assembling the data. This paper was largely completed while I was a Director of Research at the New York Stock Exchange. The opinions expressed in this paper do not necessarily reflect those of the members or directors of the NYSE.

**Tel.: +1 979 845 1224.
E-mail address: eboehmer@cgsb.tamu.edu.
inferring execution quality from costs alone could be problematical. It also illustrates the need for models of trader behavior that can accommodate multiple dimensions of execution quality.

1. Introduction

The economic importance of order execution quality in equity markets has generated substantial attention from financial economists. Yet, data limitations have largely confined analysis to a single dimension of execution quality, the out-of-pocket costs of completing an order, and have required approximate algorithms to estimate these costs. While costs are probably the single most important component of execution quality, the recent proliferation of alternative trading systems, automated trading algorithms, and online trading suggests that the speed of order executions is also important to traders. For example, Boehmer et al. (2004) find that markets generally receive more order flow when either execution costs decline or execution speed increases. (Blume, 2001, also argues that execution speed is important. He cites a May 2000 survey in which 58% of online traders rate speed as more important than a favorable price.)

This study uses novel data that eliminate the need for approximations and allow a simultaneous analysis of two dimensions of execution quality, costs and speed. I compare market-order executions on the two dominant U.S. equity markets, the New York Stock Exchange and the Nasdaq Stock Market. Reports published in accordance with Securities and Exchange Commission (SEC) Rule 11Ac1-5 (Dash 5) allow a comparison based on actual orders. Since fall 2001, the rule has required U.S. market centers to report various standardized measures of execution quality for orders below 10,000 shares in nearly all publicly traded securities. Compared with the traditional approach of estimating execution costs from trade reports, order-based analysis does not require approximate algorithms to determine trade direction and the timing of benchmark quotes. Moreover, Rule 11Ac1-5 makes the average order execution speed, or the period between order receipt and execution, publicly available.

1 Extant data sources report the size and price of trades but do not reveal details of the underlying buy and sell orders. Because knowing which side initiated the trade is essential in estimating execution costs, researchers resort to algorithms to infer the initiator by comparing trade prices with prevailing quotes and past trades. Lee and Ready (1991), among others, show that these algorithms are fairly accurate but cannot classify all trades correctly. These residual classification errors perhaps are not random and conceivably lead to substantial biases in estimated execution costs.

2 Throughout the paper, the term “execution quality” refers to several components that concern a trader, including effective spreads, realized spreads, and the speed of execution. Effective spreads are based on the difference between the trade price and the prevailing quote midpoint, while realized spreads are a forward-
دریافت فوری
متن کامل مقاله

امکان دانلود نسخه تمام متن مقالات انگلیسی
امکان دانلود نسخه ترجمه شده مقالات
پذیرش سفارش ترجمه تخصصی
امکان جستجو در آرشیو جامعی از صدها موضوع و هزاران مقاله
امکان دانلود رایگان ۲ صفحه اول هر مقاله
امکان پرداخت اینترنتی با کلیه کارت های عضو شتاب
دانلود فوری مقاله پس از پرداخت آنلاین
پشتیبانی کامل خرید با بهره مندی از سیستم هوشمند رهگیری سفارشات