Vaccine xxx (2017) xxx–xxx

Contents lists available at ScienceDirect

Vaccine

journal homepage: www.elsevier.com/locate/vaccine

The importance of vaccine supply chains to everyone in the vaccine world

Bruce Y. Lee [a,b,*], Leila A. Haidari [a,b,c]

[a] HERMES Logistics Team, Pittsburgh, PA and Baltimore, MD, United States
[b] Global Obesity Prevention Center (GOPC) at Johns Hopkins University, Johns Hopkins Bloomberg School of Public Health, Baltimore, MD, United States
[c] Pittsburgh Supercomputing Center (PSC), Carnegie Mellon University, Pittsburgh, PA, United States

ARTICLE INFO

Article history:
Available online xxxx

Keywords:
Immunization
Supply chains
Logistics

ABSTRACT

While the focus of many in the vaccine world has been on developing new vaccines and measuring their effects on humans, failure to understand and properly address vaccine supply chain issues can greatly reduce the impact of any vaccine. Therefore, everyone involved in vaccine decision-making may want to take into account supply chains when making key decisions. In fact, considering supply chain issues long before a vaccine reaches the market can help design vaccines and vaccine programs that better match the system. We detail how vaccine supply chains may affect the work and decision making of ten examples of different members of the vaccine community: preclinical vaccinologists, vaccine clinical trialists, vaccine package designers, health care workers, epidemiologists and disease surveillance experts, policy makers, storage equipment manufacturers, other technology developers, information system specialists, and funders. We offer ten recommendations to help decision makers better understand and address supply chains.

1. Introduction

While the focus of many in the vaccine world has been on developing new vaccines and measuring their effects on humans, even the most effective vaccine on the market cannot have any impact on human health without reaching the human body. A vaccine supply chain is the complex system of steps, processes, equipment, vehicles, and locations involved in getting vaccines (many of which are highly perishable or temperature sensitive) from their origin to their destination. Failure to understand and properly address this system can greatly reduce the impact of any vaccine. Therefore everyone involved in vaccine decision-making (not just those specializing in supply chains), ranging from scientists to funders to policy makers to public health officials to other decision makers, may want to take into account supply chains when making key decisions. In fact, considering supply chain issues long before a vaccine reaches the market can help design vaccines and vaccine programs that better match the system.

Other industries have examples of companies that used extra attention to supply chains to achieve considerable competitive advantages. One example is Amazon whose core business is helping a large and diverse array of manufacturers deliver goods to customers rapidly and effectively. Many of these companies employ or consult supply chain experts regularly to ensure that their supply chains run effectively and efficiently. Additionally, product design often occurs with supply chains in mind. The packaging, size, shape, and composition of the product facilitate its storage and delivery. Examples include IKEA developing furniture that can be shipped in its component parts more readily and food manufacturers adding preservatives and developing dried and compact versions of food.

By contrast, evidence suggests that vaccine supply chains have not received the same degree of attention. Studies have shown that many vaccine supply chains around the world have substantial constraints and bottlenecks and are not delivering vaccines to many people who need them [1]. Supply chains issues have hindered efforts to control, eliminate, or eradicate diseases such as polio and measles [2]. While supply chains in many low and middle income countries may have the most substantial problems, many vaccine supply chains in high income countries face challenges as well. For example, the 2009 H1N1 influenza pandemic exposed many existing limitations of the vaccine supply chains

* Corresponding author at: HERMES Logistics Team, Public Health Computational and Operations Research (PHICOR), Global Obesity Prevention Center (GOPC), Department of International Health, Johns Hopkins Bloomberg School of Public Health, 615 N. Wolfe St. Room W3501, Baltimore, MD 21205, United States.
E-mail address: brucelee@jhu.edu (B.Y. Lee).

http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.vaccine.2017.05.096
0264-410X/

in the United States. During the pandemic, some locations faced vaccine shortages while others had surplus [3]. Additionally, studies have shown disparities in access to immunization services in the United States, affecting in particular lower income and minority populations [4].

A question is whether people in the vaccine world (beyond those who deal directly with vaccine supply chains) realize how much their work is affected by and affects vaccine supply chains. Many different scientific and clinical disciplines face problems with specialists remaining in silos with less than ideal communication among them [5]. Education, training, funding, and organization structures such as university departments can encourage rather than discourage such silos [6]. What follows are ten examples of different members of the vaccine community and how vaccine supply chains may affect their work and decision making.

2. Examples of vaccine stakeholders

2.1. Preclinical vaccinologists

The biological characteristics of a vaccine can greatly impact vaccine supply chains and their operations. For example, the number of doses required to achieve immune protection and the duration of protection can affect how often a person requires vaccination. Increasing the number of doses needed per person can increase the volume of vaccines that a supply chain needs to handle, leading to or exacerbating bottlenecks that impede the flow of all vaccines [7]. As another example, replacing even one routine vaccine with a thermostable presentation (i.e. a vaccine that can be stored and transported outside of the cold chain at ambient temperatures) can not only improve the availability of the thermostable vaccine but can also relieve bottlenecks and thereby raise the availability of other, non-thermostable vaccines [8].

2.2. Vaccine clinical trialists

Many decisions made by those involved in the clinical development and testing of vaccines are interconnected with vaccine supply chains. For example, as HERMES modeling work in Thailand demonstrated, a vaccine's selected target population can substantially affect the delivery of not only the vaccine but other vaccines as well [9]. Choosing universal vaccination rather than a more focused higher risk target population for the seasonal influenza vaccine such as children, pregnant women, health care workers, and older adults would result in bottlenecks from the additional volume of vaccines during the flu vaccination season that then would impede the flow of other vaccines. As clinical trialists make decisions such as identifying target populations for a new vaccine, they should consider the system-wide effects that various targets may have and the potential need for supply chain strengthening in order to accommodate such targets.

2.3. Vaccine package designers

The size and shape of a vaccine package can greatly affect supply chain operations as evidenced in 2006 when the initial packaging for rotavirus vaccines was too large for supply chains in Latin America to handle [10,11]. Both Merck's RotaTeq and GlaxoSmithKline's Rotarix filled substantially greater cold chain volumes than other routine vaccines, creating and exacerbating bottlenecks that ultimately disrupted the flow of all vaccines [12]. This led Merck and GlaxoSmithKline to re-design the packages to be smaller. Subsequent modeling has compared the relative impact on supply chain logistics and the availability of all vaccines when introducing rotavirus vaccine in various packaging sizes, showing dramatic, system-wide reductions in stockouts when changing the size of a single vaccine [7,13].

2.4. Healthcare workers

Healthcare workers have to adapt their practice based on the availability of products such as vaccines. Supply chain issues can lead to stockouts that cause healthcare workers to turn people away without vaccinations [14]. To prevent this, healthcare workers in some systems resort to ad hoc solutions. For example, healthcare workers at facilities that normally receive regular shipments of vaccines may instead travel from their posts to pick up vaccines when shipments do not arrive in time [15]. When vaccine refrigerators are not functional, healthcare workers may resort to storing vaccines in cold boxes with ice packs, which carries a greater risk of freezing the vaccines [16]. In both cases, health facilities may be forced to close while healthcare workers are away retrieving vaccines or ice packs, resulting in additional missed vaccination opportunities.

2.5. Epidemiologists and disease surveillance experts

The dynamics of infectious disease can depend heavily on vaccine coverage in a population. Many measures of coverage are indirect and may not account for the vaccine supply chain. For example, if coverage estimates sample locations that have better functioning supply chains than others, will these be representative? Studies have shown supply chain constraints to vary widely within individual countries, resulting in substantial heterogeneity in vaccine availability [17,18]. When supply chains are not functioning effectively, allocating vaccines towards a population does not necessarily mean that the population will receive them.

2.6. Policy makers

Supply chain issues are integral to most decisions that policy makers have to consider. For example, while policy makers were working to introduce inactivated polio vaccine (IPV) procured through the United Nations Children's Fund (UNICEF) in low and middle income countries around the world, challenges in the planning and execution of IPV introduction impacted the supply chain from manufacturers to countries as well as in-country supply chains to the sites where vaccine are administered. UNICEF reported shortages of IPV in 2015 that continued through 2016 due to technical issues that manufacturers encountered when scaling up bulk production; additionally, a lack of firm guidance on the doses required and dosage timing when responding to an outbreak posed obstacles for estimating in-country demand [19]. These challenges have ultimately led to delays in introducing IPV in some countries. This experience highlights the importance of supply chain considerations when planning the implementation or scale-up of new vaccine introductions.

2.7. Storage equipment manufacturers

When developers and manufacturers are designing equipment to store vaccines at locations throughout the supply chain and during transport, there may be a tendency to focus on the individual user rather than the entire supply chain. But storage equipment sits within a larger ecosystem and characteristics such as power requirements, internal capacity, and price can have reverberating effects throughout the supply chain. Vaccine supply chain performance and efficiency depend on the ability of the system to meet storage device needs (such as maintenance

Please cite this article in press as: Lee BY, Haidari LA. The importance of vaccine supply chains to everyone in the vaccine world. Vaccine (2017), http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.vaccine.2017.05.096